Using Culture and Natural Law To Strengthen a Modern Justice System

Native American Rights Fund
Brett Lee Shelton
Staff Attorney
Indigenous Peacemaking Initiative

• Priorities:
1. Models from other tribes
2. Training
3. Technical Assistance
4. Advocacy
American justice is in crises:

• Interestingly America is looking at traditional Native American processes such as Peacemaking, Sentencing Circles and other dispute resolution processes

• The Native American lens—the traditional dispute resolution process is not “alternative”.

• It has been a way of life for indigenous communities for millenia
Tribal Sovereignty, the Impact of Federal Policy:

- Pre-contact: tribal sovereign governments intact, Treaty making period
- Movement to the reservation - 1850-1887
- Allotment/Assimilation - 1887-1934
- Indian Reorganization Act - 1934-1953
- Termination and Relocation - 1953-1968
- Tribal Self-Determination and Tribal Governance 1968 to present
Understanding the impact of failed federal policies:

designed to:

– assimilate
– terminate
Fairbanks: 5 guiding principles:

• 1. We have been facing the wrong way
• 2. Understanding the impact of federal policies and the impact on Native America
• 3. Understanding the significance of oral tradition and Native American language as the common law of Tribes
• 4. Re-educate the educated
• 5. A call for consensus, cooperation, comity and unity
  – Cheryl Fairbanks, UNM Law School
Turn around.....

• Placing value on our ways, our traditions, culture and way of life
• We have been looking to the outside for answers ...
• It’s time to turn around
• And look within our respective tribal communities for the answers
• Draw upon tribal values, traditions and law in a contemporary context
We have been facing the wrong way....

- A replication society
  - Adoption of federal and state court models
- A “be-like” mentality
- Our courts have been strongly criticized for this:
  “A pale replication of American justice-in both conception and operation some of the tribal courts are little more than pale copies of the white system. All remedies to their operational problems are directed toward making them better copies.” ~ Samuel J. Brakel
  - modern court assessments?
Re-educate the educated

• Education has always been valued in Indian country.
• We must pause and rethink our education and systems... due to the western education model, many of our indigenous concepts were deliberately destroyed and forbidden
• Education was the way to assimilation and termination; now it is the greatest tool for the protection and strengthening of tribal sovereignty.
• Elders-keepers of the wisdom
• Understanding the significance of oral tradition
• Never to replicate past termination and assimilation policies
New/Old Spirit of:
Unity, consensus, cooperation and comity

• Universal law of respect.

• Consensus: A process of decision-making that seeks widespread agreement among group members; general agreement among the members of a given group or community, each of which exercises some discretion in decision-making and follow-up action.

• Comity: In law, specifically refers to legal reciprocity—the principle that one jurisdiction will extend certain courtesies to other nations (or other jurisdictions within the same nation), particularly by recognizing the validity and effect of their executive, legislative, and judicial acts.

• Unity: is the state of being undivided or unbroken.
Indigenous concepts related to peacemaking:

- Using custom is essential for the cultural survival of Indian people and nations;

- Indian common law comes directly from the native language and our cultural viewpoint—it becomes the distinct unique law of each Tribe;

- The elders are valued for their knowledge and wisdom and serve as a resource for the process;

- The oral tradition—has been the glue that has kept our people together in the face of severe termination policies of the federal government
Peacemaking? Why?

• Whenever you have a continuing relationship
• No anonymity in Indian country;
• Process is critical and lends itself to healing
• The law evolves from the process
• Language is key
• Consensus is necessary
• Brings a spiritual element to difficult situations
“Tribal Courts are important to community and to nation building. They’re the mechanisms to promote peace.”

~ Judge Joseph Flies-Away
Hulapai
The peacemaking process is related to the concept of k’e, or respect. K’e means to restore my dignity, to restore my worthiness.”

~ Robert Yazzie, Chief Justice Navajo Nation
“The tribal courts and our indigenous concepts of justice shall be the guardians of our people, our communities and our tribal sovereignty”

~ Rae Nell Vaughn
Former Chief Justice
Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians
Holyfield:

“...we must defer to the experience, wisdom, and compassion of the tribal courts to fashion an appropriate remedy.”

~ Holyfield, 490 U.S. at 54.
A paradigm shift for the future: indigenous justice for our youth:

• “...working with youth in crises is challenging---we, as judges, have options to use a therapeutic model, such as peacemaking, to ensure an effective process. Our Native youth will be our upcoming leaders. .. they will be the ones to carry the torch for us... to protect our tribal sovereignty in future years. Our Choctaw values and traditional laws continue to pave the way for our Tribe’s future.”

~ Hon. Kevin Briscoe
Mississippi Band of Choctaw Indians
Chief Justice
Why Does it Work?

• Sense of belonging
• Self Esteem/Dignity
• Support from group, family
• Mutually derived/consented outcomes
• Focus on the problem, healing, not labelling the person as bad.
• Reflects who we are
Success in Many Kinds of Disputes:

• Domestic-family disputes—restitution
• Probate—simple; tribal law precedent
• Trespass, Property disputes
• Commercial transactions
• Employee-employer disputes
• IDR—“Inter” dispute resolution [within companies/organizations/tribes, etc.]
• Criminal
• Repatriation case
• Child custody—Abused/Neglected (per children’s code)
• Domestic violence—forgiveness case
• Tribal, state, national and international
Thank You! - Wopila

- www.narf.org/peacemaking

Brett Lee Shelton, Staff Attorney
Native American Rights Fund
303-447-8760
shelton@narf.org